

INDEX

Litigating Immigration Cases in Federal Court, 5th Edition

A

AAO (Administrative Appeals Office)

legalization appeals to, 647

Abuse of discretion standard

habeas corpus review, 433–434

motion to reopen, 366

ADAA (Anti-Drug Abuse Act of 1988)

aggravated felony, history of term,
731–732

Adjudication

administrative policy implemented
through, 762n217

Adjustment of status

advance parole and, 486–487

Chinese Student Protection Act, 142

consequences of failure to appear,
353–354

delay cases, 79–80

discretionary relief not previously
applied for, 367–368

Duran-Gonzalez class members,
324–325

judicial review of expedited order of
removal, 314–318, 324–
325

motion to reopen for, 174–175, 374–
375, 379

Administrative Appeals Office (AAO)

legalization appeals to, 647

Administrative notice of new facts

due process concerns, 220

Administrative Procedure Act (APA)

generally, 82

Chevron deference rule and, 673

deportation or removal cases, APA
not applicable to, 72–73

habeas proceedings not reviewed
under, 421–422

judicial review, 515–593, 601

application for immigration

benefits, 521–522

arbitrary and capricious

standard, 565–567

BIA sua sponte decision to

reopen removal

proceedings, 533

consular denial of visa, 560–561

decisions made outside removal
proceedings, 519–
533

decisions made outside removal
proceedings but
renewed before IJ,
522–527

deferred inspection, right to
counsel, 578–579

de novo standard of review, 564

discovery, 581–583

discretionary decisions. *See*
Judicial review of
discretionary
decisions

due process, 568–576

employment authorization, 522

expedited removal proceedings,
right to counsel,
579–580

extension of stay, 519–520

freedom of speech cases, 560–
561

inspections at border, right to
counsel, 578–579

labor certification and visa
petitions, 557–558

legalization procedures, 529–
530

mandamus for delay cases, 595–
604

marriage fraud penalty, 520–
521, 558–559

- naming of proper defendants, 561–562
 - “pattern and practice” cases, 527–532
 - porting under AC21, 559–560
 - reinstatement of nonimmigrant status, 519
 - removal proceedings (INA §242) vs. other immigration decisions (28 USC §1331), 517–533
 - right to counsel, 576–580
 - scope of review, 564
 - standards of review, 564–567
 - standing, 556–561
 - substantial evidence standard, 565
 - termination of asylum status, 521
 - time for filing, 555–556
 - venue, 563
 - lawsuits brought under, 72–76
 - no stay of administrative decision pending administrative appeal, 75–76
 - regulatory exhaustion requirement, 74–76
 - required vs. permissive administrative appeals, 74–75
 - statutory exhaustion requirement, 74
 - preliminary injunctions, 583–589
 - standard of review, 651
 - stay of removal, 589–593
 - substantial evidence standard, 119
 - temporary restraining orders, 583–589
- AEDPA (Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996)**
- judicial review of criminal cases, 176–177
- Aggravated felony**
- deportability for conviction, 731–733, 826
 - elimination of extreme hardship waiver, 737
 - judicial review of expedited order of removal, 310–311
- All Writs Act**
- generally, 82
- Ambiguity**
- Chevron* deference rule and, 676–681
 - determination of statutory ambiguity, 758n203
- Amicus work**
- fees awarded for, 898
- Anti-Drug Abuse Act of 1988 (ADAA)**
- aggravated felony, history of term, 731–732
- Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996 (AEDPA)**
- judicial review of criminal cases, 176–177
- APA.** *See* Administrative Procedure Act
- Appeals.** *See also* Courts of appeals
- BIA appeals and exhaustion of administrative remedies, 54–56
 - fair opportunity for administrative appeal, 219–221
 - FOIA requests, 782
 - notice of appeal rights, 219–220
 - required vs. permissive administrative appeals, 74–75
 - streamlined decisions review, 143–144
 - waiver of right to appeal, 67–69
- “Arbitrary and capricious” standard**
- APA provisions, 565–567
 - discretionary decisions, standard of review, 122–124
- Arriving aliens**
- habeas corpus proceedings, 296–297
 - judicial review of expedited order of removal, 299–310

due process challenge, 302–303
 habeas corpus proceedings,
 301–302
 jurisdiction to review, 301–302
 motions to reopen order, 309–
 310
 order of removal as unlawful,
 303–309
 lawful permanent residents as. *See*
 Lawful permanent
 residents as arriving
 aliens

Asylum

appeals, streamlined review, 143
 judicial review of expedited order of
 removal, 318
 judicial review of orders of removal,
 asylum-only
 proceedings, 101–102
 one-year time bar on applications,
 185–187

Attorney General actions

judicial review of removal orders,
 187–190

Attorneys. *See* Effective assistance of
 counsel

Attorneys' fees

EAJA awards. *See* Equal Access to
 Justice Act
 FOIA awards, 789–796

***Auer* deference**

discussed, 707–713

B**Board of Immigration Appeals (BIA)**

criticisms of, 1–2
 failure to appeal to, under exhaustion
 of administrative
 remedies doctrine, 54–56
 orders of removal. *See* Judicial
 review of orders of
 removal

streamlining regulations, review of
 violation of, 139–142

Bond issues

judicial review. *See* Judicial review
 of custody and bond
 issues

Border searches

generally, 248–252
 fixed checkpoints, 249–250
 “functional equivalent” of border,
 248–249
 right to counsel, 578
 roving patrols, 250–252

***Brand X* deference**

discussed, 698–707

***Buckhannon* standard**

attorney’s fees, 872–875

Burden of proof

lawful permanent residents as
 arriving aliens, 482–484
 suppression of evidence, 284–285

C**CARRP (Controlled Application
 Review and Resolution
 Program)**

delay cases, 595

“Case or controversy” requirement

justiciability, 11–12

Catalyst theory

attorney’s fees, 870–872

**CAT (Convention Against Torture)
 relief**

asylum-only proceedings, 101
 judicial review of decisions denying
 deferral of removal,
 180–181
 reinstated order of removal, 321–322

Causation

standing requirement, 14–15

Central address filing system

IMMACT90 requirements, 352

- Change of address**
 IMMACT90 requirements to notify EOIR, 352–353
- Chenery rule**, 112–114
- Chevron deference rule**
 generally, 671–713
 administrative framework, 671–672
 APA and, 673
Auer deference, 717–713
Brand X deference, 698–707
 circuit court law, 688–689
 citizenship issues, 684
 congressional intent, 673–674
 constitutional issues and, 114
 distinguishing between “closed” and “open” statutes, 747n155
 four-step inquiry, 674–675
 naturalization issues, 684
 retroactivity issues, 689–690
 rule-making power
 agency exercise of, 690–698
 delegation of, 681–690
 reasonableness of agency decision, 694–698
 state and federal criminal law, 685–688
 state law, 688
 statutory ambiguity, 676–681
 two-step inquiry, 673–674
- Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882**
 congressional authority, 803
 habeas proceedings, 423
 impermissible retroactivity of, 725
- Chinese Student Protection Act**
 adjustment of status, 142
- Circuit court law**
Chevron deference rule, 688–689
- Citizenship claims.** *See also* Judicial review of citizenship claims
Chevron deference rule and, 684
 colorable claim to citizenship, 496–497
 exhaustion of administrative remedies, 64–65
 judicial review of orders of removal, 131–134
- Civil complaints**
 generally, 836–845
 EAJA claims, 861–864
 FRCP rules governing (Rules 8-11), 838–839
 preparation of, 837–845
 items to be filed, 843–844
 pleading standards, 841–843
 service on parties, 844–845
 when and where to file, 843
- Civil proceedings**
 civil complaints, 836–845. *See also* Civil complaints
 exclusionary rule, 270–271
- Civil Rights Act of 1964, Title VII**
 catalyst theory of award of attorney’s fees, 870–872
 jurisdiction, 87
- Claim-processing rules**
 INA §242(d) as claim-processing rule, 51, 52–54
 jurisdictional rules vs., 86–90
- Claims to be presented**
 determining when and where lawsuit can be filed, 3–5
- Class actions**
 legalization lawsuits, 529–530
 mootness doctrine exception, 35–36
 “pattern and practice” cases, 527–532
- Collateral attacks**
 dismissal in section 1326
 prosecution, 416–419
 “gross miscarriage of justice”
 standard, 401–415
 prior order of removal, 401–419
 reinstated order of removal
 habeas corpus, 415–416
 motion to reopen, 395–399
 traditional collateral attack, 401–404
- Colorable claim to citizenship**
 judicial review, 496–497
- Complaints.** *See* Civil complaints

Congressional intent

Chevron deference rule, 673–674
 “closed” and “open” statutes, 746–747
 consular non-reviewability, 623–625
 retroactivity issues, 718–721

Consent

exclusionary rule, entry into home without, 277–279
 search and seizure protections, 252–253

Constitution, U.S. See also specific*Amendments*

Article I, Section 2, 812
 Article I, Section 8, 802
 Article I, Section 9, clause 1, 802
 Article I, Section 9, clause 2 (Suspension Clause), 6, 81, 147, 176, 344–348, 421
 Article III, 11–20, 30–45
 Article III, Section 1, 81
 Article III, Section 2, 81
 Article III, Section 2, clause 1, 6
 Article VI, Section 6, 812

Constitutional issues

Chevron deference rule, 114
 exhaustion of administrative remedies, 62–63
 habeas corpus review, 427–428
 international law, 828–831

Consular non-reviewability

generally, 605–646
 APA §702 and INA §279, 613–616
 background, 601–608
 “committed to agency discretion by law,” 625–626
 early cases, 608–613
 factual basis for consular officer’s decision, 644–645
 failure to act, 640–641
 failure to assert constitutional claim, 633–634
 failure to follow statute or regulations, 641–643

INA §104(a) semi-judicial review, 623

INA §106(b) and congressional intent, 623–625

Kerry v. Din, 636–639

Kleindienst v. Mandel, 617–618

naming proper defendant, 631–632

plenary power, 634–636

post-*Mandel* case law, 618–621

recent developments, 639–645

response to arguments for, 621–636

revocation of visa decisions, 640

standing, 626–631

noncitizens, 627–630

U.S. citizens and LPRs, 630–631

statutes precluding judicial review, 621–625

Continuance

failure to grant continuance, 197–199

Controlled Application Review and Resolution Program (CARRP)

delay cases, 595

Convention Against Torture. See CAT (Convention Against Torture) relief**Convictions**

guilty plea convictions, 733–734

retroactivity issues, 733–736

waiver under INA §212(c) and, 733–736

Costs, award of

EAJA. *See* Equal Access to Justice Act

FOIA attorneys’ fees. *See* Freedom of Information Act

Courts of appeals

EAJA motions, 865–869

judicial review of criminal cases, 177

premature appeal to, 348–349

reinstated order of removal, review of, 328–329

Credibility determinations

standard of review, 121

Criminal prosecutions

Chevron deference rule and, 685–688
 collateral attack of conviction, 402–403
 dismissal in section 1326
 prosecution, 416–419
 exclusionary rule, 268–270
 judicial review of, 176–184
 police acting outside of statutory or regulatory authority, 270

Custody issues

detention. *See* Detention
 judicial review. *See* Judicial review of custody and bond issues

D**Davis, Kenneth**

on exhaustion of administrative remedies, 47

Declaratory judgment actions

judicial review of citizenship claims, 655–656
 jurisdictional considerations under Declaratory Judgment Act, 81
 mootness, 31–33

Delay cases. *See* Mandamus**De novo review**

APA lawsuits, 564
 citizenship claims, 654
 constitutional issues, 114–117
 criminal statutes, 685
 motions to reopen, 370
 naturalization cases, 77–79, 658, 662, 684

Deportation. *See* Removal/deportation**Detention**

indefinite detention, 490–492
 lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens, 485–486

mandatory detention, pre-final order (INA §236(a) & INA §236(c)), 460–465
 prolonged detention
 lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens, 487–488
 post-final order (INA §241(a)), 492–493
 pre-final order (INA §236(a) & INA §236(c)), 466–472
 release from, judicial review of orders of removal, 108
 during withholding only proceedings, 472–474

Disclosure requests. *See* Freedom of Information Act**Discretionary decisions**

attorneys' fees under FOIA, 793–795
 judicial review of, 150–175. *See also* Judicial review of discretionary decisions
 motions to reopen, 366–381
 standard of review, 122–124

Domestic violence against women

reinstated order of removal (INA §241(a)(5)), 322–324
 suspension of deportation, 154–155

Due diligence

fraud, deception, or error, 389–391

Due process

administrative notice of new facts, 220
 application to APA cases, 568–576
 balancing test, 572–573
 challenges to streamlining regulations, 138–139
 consular non-reviewability, 636–639
 discretionary benefits and, 570–571
 dismissal in section 1326
 prosecution, 416–419
 effective assistance of counsel, 221–236
 ineffective assistance as private wrong, 228–231

- ineffective assistance in
 - connection with discretionary relief, 231–236
 - exclusionary rule and, 246
 - fair hearing before IJ, 196–219
 - access to evidence, 203–204
 - failure to advise of eligibility for relief, 200–202
 - failure to allow witness to testify, 204–206
 - failure to change venue, 199–200
 - failure to grant continuance, 197–199
 - failure to properly designate country of removal, 202–203
 - failure to provide explanation based on evidence in the record, 209–213
 - hearsay evidence, reliance on, 206–208
 - inadequate translation, 208–209
 - neutral judge, right to, 214–218
 - perceived inadequate
 - corroboration, right to respond to, 213–214
 - videoconferencing, 218–219
 - fair opportunity for administrative appeal, 219–221
 - fair opportunity to be heard, 195
 - judicial review of custody, 458–459
 - judicial review of discretionary decisions for violations of, 158–160
 - judicial review of expedited order of removal, 302–303
 - judicial review of reinstated order of removal, 332–333
 - liberty, protection of, 568–570
 - notice of appeal rights, 219–220
 - prejudice, 236–242
 - property, protection of, 570
 - remand, applicable law on, 243
 - removal proceedings, 191–243, 350
 - right to supplement the record, 220–221
- E**
- EAJA.** *See* Equal Access to Justice Act
 - Effective assistance of counsel**
 - due process, 221–236
 - ineffective assistance as private wrong, 228–231
 - ineffective assistance in connection with discretionary relief, 231–236
 - motion to reopen, 383–388
 - Electronic Freedom of Information Amendments (EFOIA)**
 - expedite requests, 783
 - EOIR (Executive Office of Immigration Review)**
 - IMMACT90 requirements to notify of change of, 352–353
 - Equal Access to Justice Act (EAJA)**
 - generally, 8–9, 859–904
 - adequacy of documentation, 901–902
 - amicus work, fees awarded for, 898
 - amount of award, 882–901
 - civil actions, 861–864
 - compensable work, 891–898
 - duplicative work, reduction for, 896
 - EAJA fee application work, 898
 - litigation activity, 893–897
 - post-litigation work, 897
 - pre-litigation work, 892
 - remand, work related to, 897
 - elements of fee award, 861–882
 - enhanced fees, 884–891
 - bad faith, 887–889

- counsel's possession of
 - distinctive knowledge and skills, 885
 - limited availability of qualified attorneys, 884–887
 - needful for litigation, 885
 - prevailing market rate, 889–891
 - qualified counsel not available at statutory rate, 886
 - expert witness fees, 899
 - filing motion for fees, 903
 - habeas cases, 861–862
 - interest on attorney's fees, 900–901
 - lack of substantial justification, 876–881
 - local court rules, effect of, 900
 - mandamus cases, 862–863
 - naturalization cases, 863–864
 - net worth of petitioning party, 869–870
 - non-attorney work, 898
 - no special circumstances, 881–882
 - other expenses, 899–900
 - payment of fees, 903–904
 - prevailing party, 870–875
 - Buckhannon* standard, 872–875
 - catalyst theory, 870–872
 - purpose of, 860–861
 - remanded cases, 875–876
 - statutory rate adjusted for cost of living, 883
 - time for filing motion, 864–869
 - courts of appeals cases, 865–869
 - district court cases, 865, 867–869
- Equitable tolling**
- motion to reopen, 382–391
- Evidence in the record**
- failure to provide explanation based on, 209–213
- Exclusionary rule.** *See also* Motions to suppress
- generally, 268–294
 - civil proceedings, 270–271
 - criminal prosecutions, 268–270
 - Fifth Amendment violations, 269–270
 - Fourth Amendment violations, 268–269
 - police acting outside of statutory or regulatory authority, 270
 - Fifth Amendment protections, 269–270, 280–282
 - immigration proceedings, 273–294
 - action outside of statutory or regulatory authority, 282–284
 - “egregious” violation, 273–280
 - entry into home without warrant or consent, 277–279
 - evidence of identity, 289–293
 - Fifth Amendment violations, 280–282
 - “fruit of the poisonous tree,” 285–288
 - racial profiling, 279
 - removal proceedings, statements made during, 293–294
 - shifting burden of proof, 284–285
 - widespread violations, 280
 - purpose of, 245–246
 - standing to object, 268
- Executive Office of Immigration Review (EOIR)**
- IMMACT90 requirements to notify of change of, 352–353
- Exhaustion of administrative remedies**
- generally, 47–80
 - APA lawsuits, 72–76
 - no stay of administrative decision pending administrative appeal, 75–76
 - regulatory exhaustion requirement, 74–76

- required vs. permissive
 - administrative appeals, 74–75
 - statutory exhaustion
 - requirement, 74
 - appeal to BIA, 54–56
 - citizenship claims, 64–65
 - claim-processing rule (INA §242(d)), 51, 52–54
 - constitutional challenges, 49, 62–63
 - Darby* and final administrative decisions, 72–73, 76
 - deportation or removal cases, APA not applicable to, 72–73
 - FOIA litigation, 785–786
 - futility, 63–64
 - issue exhaustion, 56–62
 - judicial review of custody, 501
 - legalization and LIFE Act cases, 76–77
 - mandamus in delay cases, 79–80
 - manifest injustice, 65–66
 - motion to reopen or reconsider, 66–67, 336
 - naturalization decisions, 77–79
 - as prudential requirement, 47–50
 - release from custody decisions, 69–72
 - removal orders, 51–69
 - as statutory requirement, 50–51
 - waiver of requirement, 47–50
 - waiver of right to appeal, 67–69
 - Exigent circumstances**
 - search and seizure, 253–254
 - Expedited order of removal**
 - judicial review. *See* Judicial review of expedited order of removal
 - mechanisms, 149–150
 - right to counsel, 579–580
 - Expert witness fees**
 - EAJA and, 899
 - Extreme cruelty**
 - suspension of deportation, 154–155
 - Extreme hardship**
 - retroactivity issues (INA §212(h) & INA §212(i)), 737–739
 - suspension of deportation, 155–156
- F**
- Fairness**
 - in applying new regulations retroactively, 754–755
 - FBI name check**
 - naturalization cases, 660–662
 - Federal Claims Collection Act**
 - payment of EAJA fees, 903–904
 - Federal Migrant and Seasonal Agricultural Worker Protection Act**
 - damages in private action, 683
 - Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (FRCP)**
 - civil complaints, rules governing (Rules 8-11), 838–839
 - Rule 11(a), 87
 - Fees.** *See* Equal Access to Justice Act
 - Fifth Amendment protections**
 - due process, 191, 350
 - exclusionary rule, 269–270
 - immigration proceedings, 280–282
 - interrogations, 263–265
 - Final order of removal**
 - assessing when order is final, 91–102
 - Findings of fact**
 - habeas corpus review, 431–433
 - judicial review of discretionary decisions, 164–166
 - standard of review, 118–121
 - Fingerprints**
 - suppression of evidence of identity, 290–293
 - Fleuti* “brief, casual, and innocent” rule**
 - retroactivity issues, 742–743
 - FOIA.** *See* Freedom of Information Act

- Form I-212**
 Application for Permission to Reapply for Admission into the United States After Deportation or Removal, 323n155
- Form I-546**
 Order to Appear for Deferred Inspection, 578
- Form I-862**
 Notice to Appear, 578
- Form I-871**
 Notice of Intent to Reinstate, 320
- Form N-400**
 Application for Naturalization, 664
- Fourth Amendment protections**
 exclusionary rule, 268–269. *See also* Exclusionary rule
 search and seizure, 246–263. *See also* Search and seizure protections
- Fraud, deception, or error**
 collateral attacks, 402n10
 due diligence exercised, 389–391
- FRCP (Federal Rules of Civil Procedure)**
 civil complaints, rules governing (Rules 8-11), 838–839
 Rule 11(a), 87
- Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)**
 generally, 763–800
 administrative appeal, 782
 agency determination, 781–782
 attorney-client privilege, 772
 attorneys' fees, 789–796
 amount of award, 795–796
 commercial benefit to plaintiff, 794
 discretionary considerations, 793–795
 eligibility, 790–792
 nature of plaintiff's interest, 794
 other recoverable costs, 796
 public benefit, 793
 reasonableness of withholding documents, 795
 “substantially prevailed” requirement, 792
 time for filing motion, 790
 attorney work-product privilege, 770–771
 contact information for requests, 797–799
 deliberative-process privilege, 768–770
 district court jurisdiction, 784–785
 exemptions, 764–778
 exhaustion of administrative remedies, 785–786
 expedited processing, 782–784
 inadequate justification for withholding documents, 788
 inadequate search for documents, 787–788
 law enforcement documents, exemption, 774–776
 list of exempted material, 777–778
 litigation privileges, exemption, 767–768
 litigation process, 784–798
 mootness, 786–787
 overview, 8
 privacy concerns, exemption, 772–774
 privacy release by third party, 800
 procedures, 779–784
 production of documents, 782, 788–789
 record for review, 399–400
 relief, 787–789
 requests for information, 779–780
 response time, 780–781
 segregable portions of record, 776–777
 standing, 786–787
 statutory exemption, 765–767
 Vaughan index, 777–778

“Fruit of the poisonous tree”
immigration proceedings, 285–288

Futility
issue exhaustion and, 63–64

G

Gap-filling rules
prospective rule-making proceedings,
746–748

Ginsburg, Ruth Bader
on judicial review under APA, 560

“Gross miscarriage of justice” standard
generally, 401–404
collateral attack on prior order of
removal, 405–415

Guilty plea convictions
waiver under INA §212(c) and, 733–
734

H

Habeas corpus. *See also* REAL ID Act of
2005

arriving aliens, 296–297
collateral attack on reinstated order
of removal, 415–416
constitutional provision, 7, 81, 147
EAJA fees, 861–862
judicial review, 176–177, 421–455,
499–514
abuse of discretion, 433–434
application of law to facts, 430–
431
constitutional claims, 427–428
development of record for, 447–
450
elimination of, 434–442
expedited order of removal,
301–302
findings of fact, 431–433
historical background, 423–424

naming of proper respondent,
453–454
petition not filed within 30 days
of BIA decision,
445–447

post-IIRAIRA, 425–426
removal orders after REAL ID
Act, 443–451
scope of review, 425–434
statutory and regulatory claims,
429–430

stay of removal, 337–348, 453
time for filing, 452
ultra vires or non-existent order
of removal, 450–
451

venue, 454–455

jurisdiction, 7

petitions
generally, 835
preparation of, 845–847
statutory provisions, 82

Hearsay evidence

reliance on, 206–208

Human rights

international law violations against
U.S., 801

I

IACHR (Inter-American Commission on Human Rights)

claims against U.S., 801
proceedings, 823–825

ICCPR (International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights)

history, 810

ICESCR (International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)

history, 810

Identity evidence

exclusion of, 289–293

**Illegal Immigration Reform and
Immigrant Responsibility
Act of 1996 (IIRAIRA)**

class actions, 532
controlled substance offenses under
INA §212(a)(2)(A)(i)(II)
& INA §237(a)(2)(B)(i),
745–746
expedited removal, 299–300
extreme hardship under INA §212(h)
& INA §212(i), 737–739
judicial review of criminal cases,
176–177
jurisdiction-stripping provisions,
147–190. *See also*
Jurisdiction-stripping
provisions
reinstated order of removal, 318–327
release from custody, 464–465
retroactivity issues, 733–746
standard of review, 120
waiver under INA §212(c), 733–746
when and where to file, 5–6

IMMACT90. *See* Immigration Act of
1990

Immigration Act of 1917

deportation orders, challenges to, 424

Immigration Act of 1990 (IMMACT90)

in absentia order of removal, 352–
362

naturalization applications, 668

Immigration and Nationality Act (INA)

authority, 803
“channeling” provisions, 82–83
court process, 149
preclusion provisions, 83–86

Immigration judges

criticisms of, 1–2
fair hearing before. *See* Due process
neutral judge, right to, 214–218

Immigration proceedings

exclusionary rule, 273–294. *See also*
Exclusionary rule
Fifth Amendment protections, 280–
282

**Immigration Reform and Control Act
of 1986 (IRCA)**

legalization programs, 647

INA. *See* Immigration and Nationality Act

In absentia order of removal

judicial review, 350–366
exceptional circumstances, 359–
362
failure of respondent to appear,
353–354
IMMACT90, 352–362
no notice, 357–358
pre-IMMACT90, 351–352
service by regular mail, 362–
366

Ineffective assistance of counsel. *See*

Effective assistance of
counsel

“Injury in fact”

standing requirement, 13–14

**Inter-American Commission on Human
Rights (IACHR)**

claims against U.S., 801
proceedings, 823–825

Interest on attorney’s fees

EAJA provisions, 900–901

International Bill of Human Rights

history, 810

**International Covenant on Civil and
Political Rights (ICCPR)**

history, 810

**International Covenant on Economic,
Social and Cultural Rights
(ICESCR)**

history, 810

International law

generally, 801–833
constitutional interpretation, 828–831
customary international law, 820–823
facilitating consideration, 831–833
federal power over immigration,
802–812
foundational U.S. cases, 802–807
human rights developments, 807–811
“law of nations,” 820–823

limits on federal power over
immigration, 811–812
litigation, 823–827
Nuremberg Tribunal, 808–809
overview, 7
state sovereignty, 807–808
statutory interpretation, 828–831
“supreme Law of the Land,” 812–823
treaties, 812–820
use in domestic courts, 828–833

Interrogations

Fifth Amendment protections, 263–
265
“mere questioning,” 255

IRCA (Immigration Reform and Control Act of 1986)

legalization programs, 647

Issue exhaustion

generally, 56–62
citizenship claims, 64–65
constitutional claims and challenges
to regulations, 62–63
futility, 63–64
manifest injustice, 65–66

J**Jessup, Philip**

on international law, 808

Judicial review

APA application to, 515–593. *See*
also Administrative
Procedure Act
limitations on, 82–86
motion to reopen or reconsider, 335–
400
preclusion provisions, 83–86
ripeness doctrine, 40–42

Judicial review of citizenship claims

generally, 653–658
declaratory judgment actions, 655–
656
removal proceedings, 657–658

Judicial review of criminal cases

generally, 176–184
types of criminal offenses, 176

Judicial review of custody and bond issues

generally, 457–497
arrest after removal period, 494–496
“channeling” provisions, 82–83
colorable claim to citizenship, 496–
497
constitutional framework, 458–459
detention during expedited removal
proceedings, 475–476
due process considerations, 458–459
individuals applying for admission,
474–488
jurisdictional considerations, 499–
514
exhaustion of administrative
remedies, 501
“in custody” requirement, 499–
501
limitation on judicial review,
501–506
naming of proper respondent,
506–510
relief available, 511–514
venue, 510–511
lawful permanent residents as
arriving aliens, 476–486
burden of proof, 482–484
detention status, 485–486
grounds of removal, 477–482
prolonged detention, 487–488
travel on advance parole, 486–
487
post-final order (INA §241(a)), 488–
489
detention during withholding
only proceedings,
472–474
indefinite detention, 490–492
prolonged detention, 492–493
pre-final order (INA §236(a) & INA
§236(c)), 460–471
conditional parole, 461–462

mandatory detention, 460–465
 prolonged detention, 466–472
 “when released” issue, 464–465
 statutory framework, 460–496

Judicial review of discretionary decisions

generally, 150–175, 533–554
 APA §701(a)(2), “committed to agency discretion by law,” 533–537
 application of legal concepts to facts, 162–164
 characteristics of discretionary decision, 154–157
 due process violations, 158–160
 findings of fact, 164–166
 INA §242(b)(9) and order of removal, 341–344, 539–549
 INA §242(g) eliminating judicial review of removal proceedings, 337–341, 549–554
 legalization and LIFE Act cases, 647–651
 REAL ID Act and, 537–539
 reviewable aspects of, 158–175
 specifying decision as discretionary, 151–154
 statutory eligibility, 160–162
 unlawful exercise of discretion, 167–175

Judicial review of expedited order of removal

generally, 295–333
 aggravated felony, 310–311
 arriving aliens, 299–310
 due process challenge, 302–303
 habeas corpus proceedings, 301–302
 jurisdiction to review, 301–302
 motions to reopen order of removal, 309–310
 order of removal as unlawful, 303–309

“channeling” provisions, 82–83
 reinstated order of removal, 318–333
 categories of individuals not subject to reinstatement, 320–321
 challenge to validity of prior order, 409–415
 court of appeals, review in, 328–329
 Duran-Gonzales class members, 324–325
 habeas proceedings, collateral attack in, 415–416
 IIRAIRA amendments, 318–327
 motion to reopen, collateral attack in, 395–399
 retroactive application of INA §241(a)(5), 325–327
 review of order, 331–332
 time for filing petition for review, 329–330
 traditional collateral attack, 401–401
 validity of regulations, 328
 VAWA benefits, 322–324
 venue, 330–331
 withholding of removal and CAT protection, 321–322
 withholding only decision, review of, 331

Visa Waiver Program, 311–318
 adjustment of status, 314–318, 324–325
 asylum, 318
 challenges to removal, 312–313
 statutory and regulatory framework, 311–312
 where to file, 313–314

Judicial review of legalization and LIFE Act cases

generally, 647–651
 “channeling” provisions, 82–83

- citizenship claims. *See* Judicial review of citizenship claims
- decisions issued after final order of removal already in place, 650–651
- discretionary denials, 650
- habeas review, 651
- naturalization cases. *See* Judicial review of naturalization cases
- overview, 7
- review under INA §106 before October 1, 1996, 648–649
- Judicial review of naturalization cases**
 - generally, 658–670
 - “channeling” provisions, 82–83
 - de novo review by district court, 662
 - FBI name check, 660–662
 - jurisdiction of district court, 662–663
 - overview, 7
 - pendency of removal proceedings, 664–670
 - petition to review, 836, 848–849
 - scope of review, 662–664
 - time for filing, 659–660
- Judicial review of orders of removal**
 - generally, 91–146
 - “channeling” provisions, 82–83
 - citizenship claims review, 131–134
 - in habeas proceedings, 421–455
 - INA §242 considerations, 91–131
 - asylum-only proceedings, 101–102
 - BIA granting motion to reopen or motion to reconsider, 94–95
 - BIA granting voluntary departure, 95–96
 - BIA issuing order of removal, 93–94
 - BIA issuing order terminating proceedings, 93
 - BIA issuing remand to immigration judge, 96–100
 - decision on remand from BIA, 100
 - final order of removal required, 91–102
 - release from detention, 108
 - scope of review, 109–114
 - standard of review, 114–131. *See also* Standard of review
 - stay of removal, 105–107
 - stay of voluntary departure period, 107–108
 - time for filing, 102–104
 - venue, 104
 - withholding-only proceedings, 101–102
- overview, 7
- streamlined decisions review, 135–146
 - appeals, 143–144
 - BIA violation of streamlining regulations, 139–142
 - due process challenges, 138–139
 - jurisdiction, 137–138
 - “pattern and practice” cases, 144–146
- Jurisdiction**
 - generally, 81–90
 - Article I, Section 9, clause 2, 81, 85–86
 - Article III, Section 1, 81
 - Article III, Section 2, 81
 - constitutional framework, 81
 - FOIA litigation, 784–785
 - judicial review of custody, 499–514
 - exhaustion of administrative remedies, 501
 - “in custody” requirement, 499–501
 - limitation on judicial review, 501–506

naming of proper respondent, 506–510
 relief available, 511–514
 venue, 510–511
 judicial review of expedited order of removal, 301–302
 judicial review of naturalization cases, 662–663
 jurisdictional rules *vs.* claim-processing rules, 86–90
 of lower federal courts, 7
 preclusion provisions, 83–86
 statutory framework, 81–82
 streamlined decisions review, 137–138
 subject matter jurisdiction, 81–90

Jurisdiction-stripping provisions

generally, 147–190
 asylum applications, one-year time bar for, 185–187
 judicial review of criminal cases, 176–184
 judicial review of denial of voluntary departure, 185
 judicial review of discretionary decisions, 150–175. *See also* Judicial review of discretionary decisions
 prosecutorial and enforcement decisions, 187–190

Justiciability

generally, 11–45
 mootness, 30–39
 ripeness, 39–45
 standing, 12–30

L

Lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens

judicial review of custody, 476–486
 burden of proof, 482–484
 detention status, 485–486
 grounds of removal, 477–482

prolonged detention, 487–488
 travel on advance parole, 486–487

Legalization and LIFE Act cases

exhaustion of administrative remedies, 76–77
 judicial review of. *See* Judicial review of legalization and LIFE Act cases

Local court rules

EAJA and, 900

Lozada requirements

motion to reopen, 383–385

LPRs. *See* Lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens

M

Mandamus

delay cases, 79–80, 595–604
 agency’s duty to perform act, 600
 delay not discretionary, 597–599
 elements necessary for mandamus, 600–604
 mootness, 604
 no adequate alternative remedy, 603–604
 right to relief requested, 600–603
 EAJA fees, 862–863
 overview of Mandamus Act, 82
 petition for writ, 835–836, 848

Manifest injustice

issue exhaustion and, 65–66

Marriage fraud penalty, 520–521, 558–559

Marshall, John

on treaties, 815

Mathews v. Eldridge test, 572–573

Mootness

FOIA litigation, 786–787

justiciability, 30–39
 mandamus in delay cases, 604
Motions to reopen or reconsider
 in absentia order of removal, 350–
 366. *See also* In absentia
 order of removal
 benefits outside removal proceedings,
 374–375
 discretionary decisions, 366–381
 discretionary denial of, 174–175, 370
 discretionary relief not previously
 applied for, 367–368
 discretionary relief previously
 applied for, 368–370
 due diligence exercised, 389–391
 equitable tolling, 382–391
 exhaustion of administrative
 remedies, 66–67, 336
 expedited removal orders, 309–310
 ineffective assistance of counsel,
 383–388
 judicial review, 335–400
 non-in absentia motion to reopen,
 370–374
 post-departure motions, 376–379
 prejudice, 388
 preserving voluntary departure, 379–
 381
 record for review, 399–400
 reinstated order of removal, collateral
 attack, 395–399
 removal orders, 94–95
 stay of removal pending, 336–349
 habeas petitions, 337–348
 premature appeal to court of
 appeals, 348–349
 sua sponte, 391–395
Motions to suppress
 generally, 245–294
 exclusionary rule, 245–246, 268–294.
 See also Exclusionary
 rule
 interrogations, 263–265

search and seizure protections. *See*
 Search and seizure
 protections

N

Naming of proper parties

APA judicial review, 556–562
 consular non-reviewability, 631–632
 habeas review, 453–454
 judicial review of custody, 506–510

Naturalization cases

Chevron deference rule and, 684
 EAJA fees, 863–864
 exhaustion of administrative
 remedies, 77–79
 judicial review of. *See* Judicial
 review of naturalization
 cases
 petition to review, 836, 848–859

Notice

administrative notice of new facts,
 220
 of appeal rights, 219–220

Notice and comment cases

retroactivity issues, 749–752

Notice to Appear (NTA)

removal proceedings initiated by,
 578, 664

O

Open Government Act of 2007

attorneys' fees under FOIA, 789–790

P

“Pattern and practice” cases

FOIA litigation, 786–787
 streamlined decisions review, 144–
 146

Petition for habeas corpus. *See* Habeas corpus

Pleading standards

civil complaints, 841–843

Precedent decisions

retroactive application of, 746–749, 755–762

rules for judicial discretion from, 167–169

Prejudice

due process concerns, 236–242

motion to reopen, 388

Preliminary injunctions

APA lawsuits, 583–589

Privacy concerns

border searches, 251

FOIA exemption, 772–774

“Terry” stops, 256–257

Probable cause

search and seizure, 261–263

Prolonged detention

judicial review of custody

post-final order (INA §241(a)), 492–493

pre-final order (INA §236(a) & INA §236(c)), 466–472

lawful permanent residents as

arriving aliens, 487–488

Prudential requirements

exhaustion of administrative

remedies, 47–50, 56–57

R

Racial profiling

exclusionary rule in immigration proceedings, 279

REAL ID Act of 2005

habeas corpus review, 134, 181, 298, 443–451, 651

judicial review of discretionary claims, 162

judicial review of orders of removal, 177–178

overview, 8, 85–86

St. Cyr review and, 150, 298

standard of review, 120

Reinstated order of removal

generally, 318–333

categories of individuals not subject to reinstatement, 320–321

challenge to validity of prior order, 409–415

courts of appeals, review in, 328–329

Duran-Gonzales class members, 325–325

habeas proceedings, collateral attack in, 415–416

IRAIRA amendments, 318–327

motion to reopen, collateral attack in, 395–399

retroactive application of INA §241(a)(5), 325–327, 739–742

review of order, 331–332

time for filing petition for review, 329–330

traditional collateral attack, 401–404

validity of regulations, 328

VAWA benefits, 322–324

venue, 330–331

withholding of removal and CAT protection, 321–322

withholding only decision, review of, 331

Release from custody decisions

exhaustion of administrative remedies, 69–72

Release from detention

judicial review of orders of removal, 108

Reliance

retroactivity issues, 725–730

Remands

applicable law on, 243

compensable work related to and EAJA fees, 897

- decision on remand from BIA, 100
- EAJA fees, 875–876
- judicial review of orders of removal, 96–100
- Removal/deportation**
 - aggravated felony convictions, 731–733
 - APA not applicable, 72–73
 - due process. *See* Due process
 - exclusionary rule, statements made during removal proceedings, 293–294
 - ex parte pressure to favor, 1–2
 - extreme hardship for suspension of deportation, 155–156
 - judicial review of citizenship claims, 657–658
 - judicial review of orders. *See* Judicial review of orders of removal
 - lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens, grounds of removal, 477–482
 - reentry, dismissal in section 1326 prosecution, 416–419
 - suspension of deportation
 - consequences of failure to appear, 353–354
 - repeal of, 736–737
 - VAWA benefits, 322–324
- Removal orders**
 - collateral attacks. *See* Collateral attacks
 - exhaustion of administrative remedies, 51–69
 - judicial review. *See* Judicial review of orders of removal
 - petition for review
 - generally, 836, 849–858
 - filing of certified record of proceedings, 857–858
 - items to file, 856
 - preparing, 849–852
 - scheduling order, 857
 - service of, 856–857
 - stay of removal, request for, 852–854
 - stay of voluntary departure, request for, 854–855
 - time for filing, 855–856
 - where to file, 856
 - reinstated orders. *See* Reinstated order of removal
- Reopening.** *See* Motions to reopen or reconsider
- Requests for information.** *See* Freedom of Information Act
- Retroactivity issues**
 - generally, 715–762
 - Chevron* deference rule, 689–690
 - congressional intent, 718–721
 - extreme hardship under INA §212(h) & INA §212(i), 737–739
 - Fleuti* “brief, casual, and innocent” rule (elimination of INA §101(a)(13)), 742–743
 - fraud, discretionary waiver under INA §212(i), 738–739
 - new regulations, 749–753
 - application of, 746–749
 - controlled substance offenses, 745–746
 - fairness in applying retroactively, 754–755
 - intent to apply retroactively, 753
 - precedent decisions, application of, 746–749, 755–762
 - reinstated order of removal (INA §241(a)(5)), 325–327, 739–742
 - reliance, 725–730
 - repeal of suspension of deportation, 736–737
 - statutory framework, 716–717
 - stop-time rule, 743–745

substantive *vs.* interpretive regulations, 749–752
 sufficient condition for “retroactive effect,” 721–725
 waiver under INA §212(c), 733–736
 convictions after trial, 734–736
 guilty plea convictions, 733–734

Right to counsel. *See also* Effective assistance of counsel
 APA provisions, 576–580
 deferred inspection, 578–579
 expedited removal proceedings, 579–580
 inspections at border, 578–579

Ripeness doctrine
 generally, 39–45
 fitness for judicial review, 40–42
 hardship to parties, 42–45
 removal proceedings, review of, 526–527

Rule-making power. *See Chevron* deference rule

S

***St. Cyr* review**
 mixed questions of fact and law, 162
 REAL ID Act and, 150, 298
 statutory eligibility for discretionary relief, 160
 Suspension Clause and, 297–298

Search and seizure protections
 generally, 246–263
 border searches, 248–252
 fixed checkpoints, 249–250
 “functional equivalent” of border, 248–249
 roving patrols, 250–252
 consent, knowing and voluntary, 252–253

exceptions to warrant requirement, 247–260, 266–267
 exclusionary rule. *See* Exclusionary rule
 exigent circumstances, 253–254
 “mere questioning,” 255
 probable cause, 261–263
 site inspections, 267–268
 “stop and frisk,” reasonable suspicion for, 257
 “Terry” stops, 255–260, 265–266

Service of process
 deportation proceedings, 352–357
 show cause orders, 351–352

Show cause orders
 service of, 351–352

Site inspections
 search and seizure protections, 267–268

Standard of review
 generally, 114–131
 APA standard for legalization, 651
 application of law to undisputed facts, 117–118
 constitutional issues, *de novo* review, 114–117
 credibility determinations, 121
 discretionary decisions, 122–124
 failure to provide reasoned explanation, 124–131
 findings of fact, 118–121
 substantial evidence standard, 118–121

Standing requirement
 associational standing, 28–30
 causation, 14–15
 exclusionary rule, 268
 FOIA litigation, 786–787
 “generalized grievance,” 21–22
 “injury in fact,” 13–14
 “irreducible constitutional minimum,” 13–20
 justiciability, 12–30
 organizational standing, 25–28

- prudential standing, 20–25
 - redressability, 15–16
 - third party rights, 22–23
 - “zone of interest,” 23–24
 - State Department**
 - visa denials, 560–561
 - Stay of administrative decision**
 - pending administrative appeal, when required, 76
 - Stay of removal**
 - APA lawsuits, 589–593
 - habeas corpus review, 453
 - judicial review of orders of removal, 105–107, 852–854
 - Stay of voluntary departure period**
 - judicial review of orders of removal, 107–108, 854–855
 - “Stop and frisk”**
 - reasonable suspicion for, 257
 - Stop-time rule**
 - retroactivity issues, 743–745
 - Streamlined decisions review**
 - generally, 135–146
 - appeals, 143–144
 - BIA violation of streamlining regulations, 139–142
 - due process challenges, 138–139
 - jurisdiction, 137–138
 - Sua sponte**
 - motion to reopen, 391–395
 - Substantial evidence standard**
 - APA provisions, 565
 - review of fact-findings, 118–121
 - Suppression.** *See* Motions to suppress
 - Suspension of deportation**
 - consequences of failure to appear, 353–354
 - repeal of, 736–737
- T**
- Temporary restraining orders**
 - APA lawsuits, 583–589
 - Terminating proceedings**
 - judicial review of orders of removal, 93
 - “Terry” stops**
 - criminal prosecutions, 255–260
 - INA §287 and its regulations, 265–266
 - Timeliness**
 - EAJA motions, 864–869
 - FOIA motions for attorneys' fees, 790
 - habeas corpus review petition not filed within 30 days of BIA decision, 445–447
 - habeas petition, time for filing for review, 452
 - judicial review of naturalization cases, 659–660
 - judicial review of orders of removal, 102–104
 - judicial review under APA, 555–556
 - petition for review of orders of removal, 329–330
 - Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964**
 - catalyst theory of award of attorney's fees, 870–872
 - jurisdiction, 87
 - Trafficking of humans**
 - T-visa applications, 324
 - Translation**
 - inadequate translation, 208–209
 - Travel on advance parole**
 - lawful permanent residents as arriving aliens, 486–487
 - Treaties**
 - generally, 812–820
- U**
- Ultra vires**
 - habeas corpus review, 450–451
 - United Nations**
 - international human rights law, 809–811

Universal Declaration on Human Rights
history, 809–811

V

Vattel, Emerich de

on sovereign right to exclude aliens,
804, 806

VAWA (Violence Against Women Act)
reinstated order of removal (INA
§241(a)(5)), 322–324
suspension of deportation, 154–155

Venue

APA, 563
failure to change venue, 199–200
habeas corpus review, 454–455
judicial review of custody, 510–511
judicial review of order of removal,
104, 330–331

Victims of crime

T-visa applications, 324
U-visa applications, 324
VAWA benefits, 322–324

Videoconferencing

due process concerns, 218–219

Violence Against Women Act (VAWA)
reinstated order of removal (INA
§241(a)(5)), 322–324
suspension of deportation, 154–155

Visa Waiver Program

expedited removal orders, 149, 295
judicial review of expedited order of
removal, 311–318
adjustment of status, 314–318,
324–325
asylum, 318
challenges to removal, 312–313
statutory and regulatory
framework, 311–
312
where to file, 313–314

Voluntary departure

consequences of failure to appear,
353–354

judicial review of denial, 185
judicial review of orders of removal,
95–96
preserving, 379–381
stay request in petition for review of
removal order, 854–855

W

Waiver

of exhaustion of administrative
remedies, 47–50
of right to appeal, 67–69
visa program. *See* Visa Waiver
Program

War crimes

Nuremberg Tribunal, 808–809

Warrants. *See also* Search and seizure
protections

entry into home without warrant or
consent, 277–279
exceptions to warrant requirement,
247–260, 266–267
omissions and distortions in affidavit,
279–280

Withholding of removal

detention during withholding only
proceedings, 472–474
judicial review of orders of removal,
withholding-only
proceedings, 101–102,
331
reinstated order of removal, 321–322

Witnesses

failure to allow witness to testify,
204–206

Women, VAWA protections

reinstated order of removal (INA
§241(a)(5)), 322–324
suspension of deportation, 154–155